AS EDUCATORS, ALMOST EVERYTHING WE SAY TO OUR students sends a message. Some messages enhance stu-
dents’ motivation, but other messages undermine it. How
can we know which is which? Common sense and intuition
will always be a part of good teaching, but they are not
always trustworthy guides. This is where research comes
in, and helps us put our common sense to the test.

Imagine a brilliant student who enters a new school and
suddenly starts getting poor grades. Or a struggling stu-
dent who needs encouragement. Or a talented child who
lacks confidence. What should teachers say to these stu-
dents to send messages that motivate? In each case, teach-
ers might be tempted to look for opportunities to praise
the students’ abilities and assure them of their intelligence.

In a survey we gave to parents, over 80% of them thought
that it was necessary to praise their children’s intelligence in
order to give them confidence in their abilities and moti-
vate them to succeed.

Our research shows that this is wrong. As you read on,
you will find out why.

WHO ARE THE MOTIVATED CHILDREN?
For over 30 years, I have studied students’ motivation in
order to find out what makes motivated students tick. Here
is the most important thing I have learned: The most moti-
vated and resilient students are not the ones who think
they have a lot of fixed or innate intelligence. Instead, the
most motivated and resilient students are the ones who
believe that their abilities can be developed through their
effort and learning.

Is intelligence something inherent or is it something that
can be developed? Although this is not really an either/or
question, more and more research is revealing that impor-
tant parts of intelligence can be developed and that the
brain has greater potential for growth and change
throughout life than anyone ever thought. It’s also interest-
ing to know that Alfred Binet, the man who invented the IQ
test, profoundly believed that children’s intelligence could
be transformed and enhanced through education. In fact,
he devoted most of his career to developing educational
curricula that would do just that. (The IQ test was simply
created to identify children who were not profiting from
the curriculum in the Paris public schools, so that Binet
could develop courses of study that would better meet
their needs.)

My main point will be: It matters greatly what students
believe about their intelligence.

In a recently-published study, my colleagues (Lisa Black-
well and Kali Trzeniewski) and I followed over 400 students
across the transition to seventh grade, a time when many
students are derailed. At this time, the work gets harder,
the grading becomes more stringent, and the environment
becomes less personalized and nurturing. Students, as a
whole, show a concomitant decline in motivation and
grades. However, this was not equally true for all students
in our study.

It was the students who believed in fixed intelligence
who fared most poorly across this transition – even many
who had done well in the past. They showed poorer moti-
vation, less resilience in the face of difficulty, and lower
grades over the next two years. Those who believed their intelligence could be developed showed increasing grades over the same period. How did this happen?

**THE FIXED MINDSET**

Let’s look first at the students who believed in fixed intelligence and see how this fixed mindset worked to limit their achievement. The fixed mindset comes with “rules,” the cardinal rule being: *Look smart at all costs.* Not surprisingly, this rule stands in the way of learning.

For example, when our seventh graders were given a choice between learning something new and doing a task that would make them look smart, they chose the latter. In another study, we polled new students at the University of Hong Kong, an elite university where all classes are in English. We asked students who had poor English skills whether they would take a remedial English course if the faculty offered it. Students in a fixed mindset thought one disappointing grade measured their ability and their performance never recovered.

In short, students in a fixed mindset believe that if they had the intelligence, it would carry them straight through to perfect performance. Anything less spells inadequacy. This is why many talented students lack confidence in themselves. Which brings us to the next rule.

1. **Don’t make mistakes.** Students in a fixed mindset think that mistakes or setbacks mean they lack ability. Our seventh graders told us that if they got one poor grade in a new course, it would mean they weren’t good at that subject. They went on to say that they would try to drop the course and never take that subject again. In a study with pre-med college students at Columbia University we found the same thing. Students in a fixed mindset thought one disappointing grade measured their ability and their performance never recovered.

2. **Don’t work hard.** Our seventh graders in a fixed mindset thought that hard work signaled low intelligence: “To tell the truth, when I work hard at my schoolwork it makes me feel like I’m not very smart.” It didn’t matter whether the schoolwork was new or difficult; their effort was a sign of limited ability.

**THE IDEA THAT HIGH EFFORT EQUALS LOW ABILITY IS ONE OF THE WORST BELIEFS STUDENTS CAN HAVE. IT IS VIRTUALLY IMPOSSIBLE TO DO ANYTHING WORTHWHILE WITHOUT SUSTAINED EFFORT.**

**EN BREF** Bien qu’il soit logique de penser que les élèves non motivés, en difficulté ou peu sûrs d’eux pourraient bénéficier d’éloges au sujet de leur intelligence, la recherche le contredit. Les élèves qui croient que leur succès est attribuable à leur intelligence réussissent moins que ceux qui croient qu’ils doivent investir des efforts pour réussir. Les élèves ayant l’attitude ancrée que leur intelligence est à la source de leur rendement adoptent des stratégies pour avoir l’air intelligent – même s’ils apprennent alors moins. Par contre, les élèves animés d’une attitude « de croissance » croient qu’ils peuvent développer leurs habiletés et adoptent des stratégies rehaussant leurs habitudes de travail et accroissant leurs apprentissages.
This is precisely why many “gifted” students simply stop working when school becomes more difficult. Before, they’d been able to coast along and do extremely well. In a fixed mindset, that’s how they knew they were gifted. Suddenly, they can’t do that anymore. Now they have a choice: work hard and feel dumb (and worst of all maybe still not do spectacularly) or don’t work hard and act smart. Act as though you could do well if you wanted to. You just don’t care to.

The idea that high effort equals low ability is one of the worst beliefs students can have. It is virtually impossible to do anything worthwhile without sustained effort. This is why we should not tell students how great they are when they do something quickly and easily. They should not think that low effort is the hallmark of intelligence.

3. If you make mistakes, don’t try to repair them. Our seventh graders with a fixed mindset told us that if they did poorly on a test, they would study less the next time and seriously consider cheating. Hardly a recipe for success! Actually, the fixed mindset does not provide good recipes for recovering from setbacks. Setbacks indicate a lack of ability and, in the fixed mindset, that lack of ability is permanent.

In one study, we monitored students’ brain waves (EEGs) as they performed a very difficult task. What were students paying most attention to? The brain waves revealed that students in a fixed mindset were vitally interested in whether they got an answer right or wrong, but, when they were wrong, they paid little attention to what the right answer was. They were not trying to correct their errors and, as a result, did significantly worse than students with a growth mindset when they were later retested on the material.

I think we can begin to understand how a fixed mindset can limit students’ learning. Look smart at all costs. Don’t make mistakes. Don’t work hard. If you make mistakes, don’t try to correct them. Clearly, these are not rules that foster intellectual growth.

THE GROWTH MINDSET

Students with a growth mindset believe that their abilities can be developed, and so their major goal is to learn. “It’s much more important for me to learn things in my classes than it is to get the best grades.” Although these students care very much about doing well in school, they put a premium on learning. Ironically, this leads them to earn higher grades.

In other words, the cardinal rule of the growth mindset is: Learn! And like the fixed mindset, the growth mindset comes with three more rules that help students reach their goal.

1. Take on challenges. We’ve often offered students a choice between a challenging task that they can learn from and a task that is sure to make them look smart. Students in a growth mindset do not want to waste their time looking smart on tasks that offer them nothing else. They overwhelmingly want tasks that stretch their abilities and teach them new things.

2. Work hard. Rather than thinking that effort undermines ability, our seventh graders with a growth mindset believed that effort enhanced ability: “The harder you work at something, the better you’ll be at it.” They did not believe that inherent ability was the royal road to success, for even geniuses, they correctly believed, had to work hard for their successes.

3. Confront your deficiencies and correct them. In just about every study we’ve done, students in a growth mindset are eager to remedy their deficiencies. They may be very disappointed by a poor performance, but they deal with it directly. Our seventh graders with a growth mindset, after a poor grade on a test, told us that they would study harder and try different study strategies next time. Our pre-med college students with a growth mindset recovered from an initially disappointing grade through their deeper and more extensive study strategies. Our University of Hong Kong freshmen wanted the remedial English course to shore up their language skills. And the growth-mindset students in our EEG experiment confronted their mistakes and sought new knowledge to rectify them.

Clearly these are rules and practices that promote intellectual growth. What can educators do to foster a growth mindset in their students?

MINDSET MESSAGES: PRAISE

To answer this question, let’s return to the issue of praise and the message it sends. Although common sense may suggest that students who are unmotivated, struggling, or lacking in confidence might benefit from praise for their intelligence, we worried that this kind of praise might send a fixed mindset message. We worried that praising students’ intelligence, even after a job well done, might tell them: 1) I can look at your performance and judge your underlying intelligence, even after a job well done, might tell them: 1) I can look at your performance and judge your underlying intelligence, and 2) I care first and foremost about your underlying intelligence and that’s what I value you for (a fixed mindset message). We worried that praising students’ intelligence, even after a job well done, might tell them: 1) I can look at your performance and judge your underlying intelligence, and 2) I care first and foremost about your underlying intelligence, and that’s what I value you for (a fixed mindset message).

In short, we worried that praise for intelligence would put students in a fixed mindset with all of its vulnerabilities.

When we thought about the children with a growth mindset, we thought about their focus on effort and strategies, and how this focus on process allowed them to remain motivated and effective in the face of setbacks. So we wondered whether praise for effort or strategies would promote a growth mindset with its motivation and resilience.

We then conducted research to test these ideas. We studied fifth graders and kindergarteners. We studied children in inner city schools, suburban schools, and rural schools. And we found the same thing in each case.

After students received intelligence praise, they adopted a fixed mindset. They rejected a challenging task they could learn from, instead selecting the task that would make
them look smart. When they hit difficulty and made errors, they lost confidence in their ability – now they thought they were not smart – and ended up performing poorly.

Students who were praised for their effort entered a growth mindset. They wanted the challenge, they maintained their confidence and enjoyment in the face of difficulty, and they ended up performing far better, even when the task was an IQ test.

There was one more intriguing finding. Students who were praised for their intelligence later lied about their scores. This means that errors were so humiliating that they could not own up to them.

Make no mistake – children loved the intelligence praise. They smiled broadly and seemed proud of themselves. It really made the testers feel as though they had given the children something valuable. But our findings told a different story. It was praising the student’s process – which could be their effort, strategies, concentration, choices, persistence – that helped them remain motivated, confident, and effective. (For ideas about ways to deliver process praise, see my book Mindset.)

Can a growth mindset be taught directly?

GROWTH MINDSET PROGRAMS BOOST ACHIEVEMENT

Three recent studies (by Joshua Aronson, by Catherine Good, and by my group) have shown that teaching students a growth mindset results in increased motivation, better grades, and higher achievement test scores. Over a series of sessions, students were taught that their brains formed new connections every time they learned, and that over time they could become smarter. Students were very excited by the idea that they could influence their brains. They were also shown how to apply this idea to their schoolwork. Whether the students were in junior high school or at an elite university, those who received this message out-performed students in the control groups (even when the students in the control groups received excellent training in study skills). They also reported a greater investment in learning, and teachers reported noticeable changes in these students’ desire to work hard and learn.

These benefits were especially important for students who are subject to negative stereotypes – girls in math or African-American students. The effects of stereotypes were reduced when students believed that their abilities could be developed. For example, in one study the gender gap in math was greatly reduced when girls were taught the growth mindset.

CONCLUSION

Many teachers see evidence for a fixed mindset every year. The students who start out at the top of their class end up at the top, and the students who start out at the bottom end up there. Research by Falko Rheinberg shows that when teachers believe in fixed intelligence, this is exactly what happens. It is a self-fulfilling prophecy. However, when teachers hold a growth mindset, many students who start out lower in the class blossom during the year and join the higher achievers.

As educators, we want all of the students we teach to profit from our efforts. A growth mindset – ours and theirs – helps students to seek learning, to love learning, and to learn effectively.

A list of readings related to this article is available on the CEA website at www.cea-ace.ca
READINGS ON MOTIVATION AND THEORIES OF INTELLIGENCE


